The Torture and Murder of Sergei Magnitsky and The Cover Up by The Russian Government



Sergei Magnitsky (8 April 1972 – 16 November 2009)

The Torture and Murder of Sergei Magnitsky and the Cover Up by The Russian Government

- The Crime
- The Cover Up
- The Official Position of The Russian Government

Police Raid Hermitage's Offices in Moscow

On 4 June 2007, Lt. Col Artyom Kuznetsov and 25 Interior Ministry officers raided the Moscow offices of Hermitage Capital and seized all original corporate documents for the Hermitage Fund

Interior Ministry Officers Directing Raids



Lt Col Artyom Kuznetsov Krechetov Droganov Tolchinsky



Raids on Hermitage and Law Firm in Moscow





All servers & computers

Items Taken during Raids



2 vans full of client documents were taken away





Magnitsky's Testimony:

"I was told that the office was searched, and the person in charge was Kuznetsov...Lawyer was not allowed in. [Instead of using a search warrant], police officers had a separate list of companies and they were seizing the documents for companies from that list."

Hermitage's Companies Fraudulently Re-Registered Into the Name of a Convicted Murderer

Documents seized by the police were used to fraudulently re-register the Hermitage Fund's Russian companies and change directors from HSBC to convicted criminals



Source: Complaint to Russian authorities by Hermitage Fund lawyer, 3 December 2007: <u>http://russian-untouchables.com/rus/docs/D50.pdf</u>; Magnitsky's testimony to the Russian Investigative Committee, 5 June 2008: <u>http://russian-untouchables.com/rus/docs/D64.pdf</u>

4

\$230 Million of Taxes Paid by Hermitage Was Then Stolen from the Russian Treasury

On 24 December 2007, Moscow Tax Authorities approved in one day and transferred \$230 million of taxes paid by Hermitage Fund's companies to the accounts opened by criminals under the guise of an "overpaid tax refund"



Sergei Magnitsky Testifies Against The Russian Interior Ministry Officers Who Seized The Documents

On 7 October 2008, Sergei Magnitsky testified to the Russian State Investigative Committee about the involvement of Interior Ministry officers (Artyom Kuznetsov and Pavel Karpov), judges and criminals in the theft of Hermitage Fund companies and \$230 million in taxes

> <u>Testimony</u> to the Russian State Investigative Committee, 5 June and 7 October 2008



Sergei Magnitsky

"Seals of [Hermitage Fund companies] were seized by the Moscow Branch of the Interior Ministry on 4 June 2007."

"I confirm my testimony from 5 June 2008 ("Taxes paid by [Hermitage Fund companies] were very significant which caused an interest from the police officers.)"

"Powers of attorneys could not have been issued by Markelov, Khlebnikov and Kurochkin legitimately."

"The facts stated above show that the powers of attorneys issued by legitimate directors of [Hermitage Fund companies] ...were used to protect the interests of the companies... and to expose the theft of budget funds in the amount exceeding 5 (five) billion roubles [US\$230 million], which was clearly committed by the same group of persons who used the illegal re-registration of OOO Parfenion, Mahaon and Rilend and claims against these companies as an instrument to perpetrate the theft of budget funds."



Interior Ministry officer Lt Col Artyom Kuznetsov



Interior Ministry Officer Major Pavel Karpov



Victor Markelov



Vyacheslav Khlebnikov



Interior Ministry Assigns Lt. Colonel Kuznetsov To Investigate The Theft That He Was Accused of Perpetrating

On 6 November 2008, Oleg Logunov, Deputy Head of the Interior Ministry's Investigative Department, assigned Lt. Col Artyom Kuznetsov and his three subordinates to investigate the \$230 million theft in which they had been named by Magnitsky as key perpetrators

Interior Ministry Order to Appoint Kuznetsov and His Three Subordinates to Investigate \$230 million Theft (6 November 2008)







"Hereby I order to appoint Kuznetsov, Droganov, Krechetov, Tolchinsky to the investigative team on the \$230 million theft"

Signed: General Logunov



Lt Col Artyom Kuznetsov

Krechetov Droganov

Tolchinsky



Interior Ministry Also Assigns Officer Kuznetsov to Prosecute Magnitsky

Six days later Oleg Logunov also assigned Lt Col Artyom Kuznetsov and his three subordinates to prosecute Magnitsky

Interior Ministry Order to Appoint Kuznetsov and His Three Subordinates to Prosecute Magnitsky (12 November 2008)



Sergei Magnitsky is Then Arrested by the Same Officers He Testified Against Six Weeks Earlier

On 24 November 2008, Sergei Magnitsky was arrested by Lt Col Kuznetsov and three of his subordinates on orders from Investigator Silchenko of the Interior Ministry

Order to Arrest Sergei Magnitsky (24 Nov 2008)



Magnitsky Arrested at His Home (24 Nov 2008)

Magnitsky Was Put Under Intense Physical and Psychological Pressure To Make False Confession

For six months, Sergei Magnitsky was put under intense physical and psychological pressure to get him to sign a false confession stating that he stole the \$230 million of taxes

Hand-Written Statement for the Court From Detention as of 19 January 2009



Sergei Magnitsky

on you the new and another appear was also equivalently and the second theory and the object of the second second and the second second second appear these and second second appear the second second second appeared to appear the second appeared to appeared to appeared to appeared appeared to appeared to appeared appeared to appeare to appeared to appeared appeared to appeared to appeared to appeared appeared to appeared to appeared to appeared appeared to appeare to appeared to appeared to appeared appeared to appeare to appeared to appeared to appeare Agnitsky Norther the second the second of the the second second second of the second second second of the second second second of the second second second the second second second second second the second second second second second second the second second second second second the second second second second second second second second second the second secon

- "My detention is causing enormous suffering for my children, especially the older one who is now facing university entrance exams and needs my support. My younger son also suffers deeply from the separation and is breaking down from anxiety..."
- "Cells are overcrowded. 14 people can be kept in a cell with eight beds. We have to take turns to sleep"
- **Freezing:** "At the same freezing wind comes from the permanently opened window..."
 - "I have to eat in the same space as the toilet. There is constant smoke in the overcrowded cell"

"Hot food is provided essentially only once a day, at lunch time, at breakfast we get porridge with insect larvae, and at dinner – rotten boiled herring, just the smell of which causes nausea. Sometimes there is no food at all..."

<u>Cell mates:</u> "I am kept in a cell with defendants and those already convicted for violent crimes like burglary, murder and battery"

Family:

Cell:

Toilet:

Food:

Magnitsky's Arrest Is Condemned by the Council of Europe

Magnitsky's treatment is labelled as an "emblematic" example of "legal nihilism" by the Council of Europe's Special Rapporteur of Legal Affairs and Human Rights

Council of Europe Report Highlighting Abuses in Magnitsky's Detention

7 August 2009



Sabine Leutheusser-Schnarrenberger, MP Bundestag, Special Rapporteur to the Council of Europe (currently German Justice Minister)



helped to expose the frauds and the abuses of office, was arrested on 24 November 2008 and has since been detained... The reply from the Investigative Committee confirmed that Mr Magnitsky was heard as a witness in one particular criminal case but insisted that no coercive measures had been taken against him and in particular, that he was "not detained

Magnitsky Becomes Seriously Ill

In June 2009 Sergei Magnitsky became seriously ill losing 40 pounds and suffering severe abdominal pains. He was diagnosed with pancreatitis, cholecystitis and gallstones and prescribed a surgery by detention center doctors to take place on 1 August 2009

Magnitsky Develops Abdominal Pains



1 July 2008





Medical Records from Matrosskaya Tishina Detention Center 13 July 2009



Letter from D. Vasiliev, Acting Head of Matrosskaya Tishina Detention Center

14 July 2009

Surgical Operation is Prescribed

"Based on the results of the ultrasound examination, gallstones are diagnosed. **Diagnosis: Gallstones, chronic cholecystitis and pancreatis.** In one month to conduct ultrasound examination and <u>scheduled surgery</u>"

"Hereby to confirm that Sergei Magnitsky was examined on 1 July 2009 and **diagnosed with calculous cholecystitis, prescribed with** an ultrasound examination within a month and a <u>scheduled surgery</u>"

Magnitsky Is Abruptly Transferred to Butyrka Detention Centre, Which Has No Proper Medical Facilities

On 25 July 2009, a week before his scheduled surgery, Magnitsky was abruptly transferred to Butyrka, a maximum security detention center with no facilities to perform an operation or carry out an ultrasound examination



Oleg Silchenko Interior Ministry Investigator

Letter addressed to Ivan Prokopenko, Head of Matrosskaya Tishina, 2 July 2009



"Deem it necessary to transfer Magnitsky to Butyrka detention centre"



Source: Letter by Investigator Silchenko, 2 July 2009; Letter by General Petrukhin, 22 July 2009; http://russian-untouchables.com/rus/docs/D298.pdf; http://russian-untouchables.com/rus/docs/D299.pdf

Sergei Magnitsky Went into Excruciating Pain

Following 8 months of torturous condition, Sergei Magnitsky went into excruciating pain from his gallstones, chronic cholecystitis and pancreatis

-

Sergei Magnitsky



Magnitsky's cry for help Letter from Magnitsky to his attorney Kharitonov (25 Aug 2009)

Asberenn Xap morally 18 Kenerus afteremet Trignel - upp Maro meals In Tray bur our app come & BUS . NOMIGE Hoxcenni Downpri Benefabre, Breeke, police reper, wears norm ences & By makeyo modering it nanonece m Going Mourganes mus upon engoines 15 becapecence, 23 abryone 2003 rego Gene advance operagno 6 3630 a worgh 6 destance counsiliers cheevened hemotor to comprised generation of thema in the property the property of the theory of theory of the theory of the theory nelticarius, o acompres à mica l'appropriese mencine Aporenne & men gene aparennesses of nerropa secol buseno carmero nece ne bupe in glopping tome cuculine, man 120 a there upware no nee a componence Sore Recar balforiume & reduction a chenge the upenda receptor a see & epotame. Hermomps the mo yourses , normance curence Stren & obracon course, man are reperocuse in Equipere workno corne menere curge no regeneration unce Aparmyn competendance Servero 6 coppus a velon an increase legerague boggy means

"On 23 August 2009 at 4.30 pm I felt excruciating pain at the solar plexus ... I laid down and struggled with it ... a bit later the pain started to increase again even harder than earlier ... to stand against it could only be possible by sitting in a crouched position, the pain was so hard I could not even breath ... On 24th August around 4 pm a pain attack started again. I could not lay down this time, as it was hard to sustain it and again I was crouching ... My cell mate ... started pounding on the door crying for help, but no one came ..."

Sergei Magnitsky Makes 20 Requests for Medical Attention

From Butyrka, Sergei Magnitsky and his lawyers made 20 requests in writing to Government bodies for medical attention



All Requests Were Ignored or Rejected

All Government bodies systematically denied Sergei Magnitsky any form of medical attention



Magnitsky Goes into Critical Condition and Transferred to Matrosskaya Tishina

On 16 November 2009, Butyrka officials stated that Magnitsky had "acute pancreatitis, cholecystitis and gallstones" and should be transferred to Matrosskaya Tishina for "emergency hospitalisation"

<u>Report</u> to Transfer Magnitsky (16 November 2009)



Dmitry Komnov, Head of Butyrka



"Diagnosis of acute pancreatitis and cholecystitis necessitate transfer to Matrosskaya Tishina"

Signed by: Dmitry Komnov, Head of Butyrka **Transfer Approved**



Vladimir Davydov, Head of Moscow Penitentiary Service



Butyrka Detention Centre

Magnitsky Taken to Matrosskaya Tishina







Matrosskaya Tishina Detention Hospital

Magnitsky Is Beaten With Rubber Batons

Upon arrival to Matrosskaya Tishina, instead of hospitalising him, a team of 8 riot troopers placed him in an isolation cell, handcuffed him to a bed and beat him with rubber batons

Report on Use of Handcuffs

Magnitsky was beaten in an isolation cell on 16 November 2009



Signed by: O.G. Kuznetsov Sanctioned: F. Tagiev

Report on Use of Rubber Baton \prec



Signed by: D.F. Markin [sic], Witnesses: A.E. Larin, P.V. Borovkov Sanctioned: F. Tagiev

Matrosskaya Tishina Detention Centre Officials Sanctioning, Administering and Witnessing Magnitsky's Beating:



- 1. Fikhret G. Tagiev, Head of Matrosskaya Tishina Detention Center
- 2. D.F. Markov, Aid on Duty to Head of Matrosskaya Tishina
- 3. O.G. Kuznetsov, Deputy Aid on Duty to Head of Matrosskaya Tishina
- 4. A.E. Larin, inspector
- 5. P.V. Borovkov, inspector
- 6. Not known, inspector
- 7. Not known, inspector
- 8. Not known, inspector
- 9. Not known, inspector
- 10. A.A. Semenov, paramedic at Matrosskaya Tishina

Civilian Doctors Kept Outside Magnitsky's Cell While He is Being Beaten

According to the testimony of civilian doctors, they arrived to Matrosskaya Tishina at 8 pm on 16 November 2009 to treat Magnitsky, but were not allowed into his cell for one hour and eighteen minutes.





Civilian Doctors Not Allowed in Magnitsky's Cell

ОБЩЕСТВЕННАЯ НАБЛЮДАТЕЛЬНАЯ КОМИССИЯ город Москва по осуществлению общественного контроля за обеспечением прав человека в

местах принудительного содержания и содействия лицам, находящныся в местах принудительного содержания

Адрес: Москва, Лучников пер., д. 4, подъезд 3, комната 22 т/ф (495) 6211594

Фельданор Семения Александр Александранич (Саша), в присутствия вау нид СПО Иблитиной, зак измальника по лечебной части Барагоной в коблисте Такева, простоям, что учоло и делах да почика. Сделка водупаниятеля с правалятия в чилых. Правиле онто во проект всяхов, слишая, как Магкитский причая «Тде мон везди"». Поктоз закалася 19 часов.

Полнаприческую бригаду закавает на сондетнытиченияте 19-30. Протала окран 20-48. Експандирание порей нолити 6 чес, он сидет на сомения на екс было плоно, гланараторадителны. Бел время, С 75-30 до прилада дудод, и было на воруживате за избърдениях, за на на общода на совано куркупый, о на се чеся поре поредности и прилаградателно и прилаго и статата бо прогоблото на полнатически на прилаго и статата со прилаго о стататата бо прогоблото на полнатически на прилаго и статата на прилаго по статата бо прогоблото на полнатически на прилаго и статата на прилаго и стататата бо прогоблото на полнатически на прилаго и статата на прилаго на се на се поре на полнатически на прилаго и статата на полнатиче на на на Сант со стоторите. Он на полнатитата неграторите на прилаго на стататата на сограторите со на полнатитата неграторите на полнатически на полнатически на полнатически на полнатически на поредности на полнатически на полнатически на полнатически на полнатически на поредности на полнатически на полнатически на полнатически на полнатически на полнатически на поредности на полнатически Полнати

На потрос, что он сам чурствоная, ответня, что вичего особежного, это штаткая ситуация - и с психозом, и со смертаю.

Бетера с врачова плизнатритескоп скорен певеоща. Коринсками питалиен Владовореантеен (ко телефону) добшата в эту картину следующие детани Окран пришла в СНОО в 20 часов, а не в 20-48. Но ее врачей к пациенту сразу не

пустили Дали более часа. Потом пришли и склания, что он умер » Ну мы все-таки врзен «Сворой помодия, вдруг потребуются реализационные мероприятия. Пошли. Зашин в камеру. Он лежки на подку и мы определятия принамся бологической смерти. Там был кто-то из мещигроокака, потом пришли мужчина. Жожщина экрана и ви надкад.

Ментите расковни, перезо кланидановеско даут на дерта, следната, на роко пород позвоща, на соспаванет раскоста Путс и. Сладит, к. Сонк. рока, Алектика и ментителна данами токо да о спохода ката восита, расковна ракика претокваната и дерения собятата, а тих, на ма и са собяза и редока подела, ток претокована с лина полека позватаката в събя. Причина этого не ясны, веда все указанавате лища неоднорате данали показаната садетнико.

Нечальния Матросской типляны настаныя на смерти по прачине сердца, так как это подтверждаю, что дангно пакарелит – дугый, что все бало правляло - к перевод <u>туплеру</u>, в что устотиво лечения, и прочек. Преказивания Магитатого поле 12 полеба, когда го останаях под стражей привеля его к гиблях. Сердое лепредсказуемо, с побым может случиться.

Однико болезненный живот и незадолго до этого сдяланная. ЭКТ эту версию не подтверждят. И его покизо - он говорая, что его хотят убить, требовах свои веди (у него действительно проплан записи)- может быть баля поляне адеяватной реакцией на произходяще

Поведение захруга Грусс нанимает больше вопроси, почему она оснавна болького Магнателого в острои болевником состояния в более одного, без врачебной поноще? Грусс соворная соек, то у Магнитогого была позвана на рооту. То есть, очеждоо, что была принана обосрежия давореатита. По словам Гаусе, полко был ведоятия и Магнитский волор усполовала, Тогда, дотекуют ок от оснавия ведоургенсово о еденяние?

Главный вывод, который можно сделать: в СНЗО «Матросская типшиа» Магнитскому не была оказана медицинская помощь, в которой он нуждался и для осуществления которой его перевели из СНЗО Бутырка. Больного в тяжелом (сотоянии пожкитуески оставили (на 1 час 18 минут) умирать

в боксе без врачебной помощи.

Report by the Moscow Public Oversight Commission on Magnitsky's Death in Custody

28 December 2009

"The medical team arrived at 8 pm but was not let in to see the patient. They were made to wait for more than an hour... The main conclusion that can be drawn is that... the patient in serious condition was left for 1 hour and 18 minutes to die in an isolation cell"

19

Civilian Doctors Find Magnitsky Dead on the Cell Floor

On 16 November 2009, at 9:15 pm, Dr Kornilov a civilian emergency doctor was finally let into the cell where Magnitsky was beaten after waiting for one hour and eighteen minutes to find Magnitsky dead on the floor in a pool of urine with bruises from handcuffs on his wrists, noting signs that death had occurred at least 15 minutes before their arrival.

Testimony by Dr Kornilov, Civilian Emergency Doctor (8 Dec 2009)



"I was shocked to find the patient not in a hospital room, but in a regular cell, <u>on the floor dead</u>"

The Cover Up

Prison Officials Changed The Time and Place of Death

Matrosskaya Tishina doctor - Alexandra Gaus gave a false account of the time and place of Magnitsky's death. She also claimed that attempts were made to resuscitate him, which was refuted by civilian doctor Kornilov



Cause of Death Changed by The Interior Ministry

At 10.30 am on November 17, 2009, Magnitsky's lawyers were told by Matrosskaya Tishina staff that he had died from pancreonecrosis, rupture of the abdominal membrane and toxic shock. The Interior Ministry changed the cause of death to a heart failure at noon that day





Matrosskaya Tishina officials

<u>Cause of Death Reported</u> <u>MORNING - 17 November 2009</u>

- Pancreonecrosis
- Rupture of the abdominal membrane
- Toxic shock





Irina Dudukina, Interior Ministry's spokeswoman

<u>Cause of Death Reported</u> NOON - 17 November 2009

- Heart failure
- No signs of violent death

Magnitsky's Family Twice Requests an Independent Autopsy And Both Are Denied by The Prosecutor's Office

Magnitsky's family applied twice for an independent autopsy. Both requests were rejected by the Moscow Prosecutor's Office



Sergei Magnitsky Buried Without Any Independent Examination

Sergei Magnitsky was buried on November 20, 2009 without any independent third-party medical evaluation or autopsy

Sergei Magnitsky's Burial (20 November 2009)



Signs of Violence on Magnitsky's Body

The denial of an independent medical examination was particularly suspicious when pictures from Magnitsky's body showed signs of violence

Magnitsky's Left Hand, 17 Nov 2009

Magnitsky's Knuckles 17 Nov 2009 Magnitsky's Left Knee 17 Nov 2009 Magnitsky's Wrist 17 Nov 2009









A Local Detective Requested to Open a Murder Investigation Immediately After Examination of the Crime Scene

A detective at a local district Investigative Committee office recommended opening a murder investigation after examining the evidence of the case



Investigative Committee Office of Preobrazhensky District of Moscow

Detective Levin D.A. 19 November 2009

"Taking everything into account, there is sufficient evidence to warrant opening an investigation into the crime set out by Article 105 ...of the Criminal Conduct Code of Russia [murder] ..."

Magnitsky's Family Makes Four Requests to Open Criminal Investigation into Sergei's Death

Despite four separate requests by Magnitsky's family to open a criminal investigation, Russian authorities found "no violations" in the actions of state officials and refused to open a criminal case

Request to the General Prosecution Office to Open Criminal Case Against Silchenko, Komnov, Burov



18 November 2009

Request to the Investigative Committee to Investigate Signs of Magnitsky's Murder



Request to the Investigative Committee to Investigate Signs of Violent Death



24 November 2009

Request to the General Prosecution office to Prosecute for the False Arrest and Persecution



25 November 2009

Source: Petitions filed by the "Gridnev and Partners" on 18,20,24 and 25 November 2009 with General Prosecutor's Office, Russian Investigative State Committee and Prosecutor's Office of Preobrazhensky district of Moscow

The Russian Interior Ministry Immediately Announced They Did Not Know He Was Sick

On November 17, 2009, the Russian Interior Ministry claimed that Magnitsky never complained about his health and they had no knowledge that he had been sick and required medical care



Irina Dudukina, spokeswoman, Interior Ministry's Investigative Department



Interior Ministry's Official Website

Official Statement, 17 November 2009

"There has not been a single complaint from Magnitsky about his health in the criminal case file."

"Magnitsky never complained about his health. His sudden death was a shock for investigators."

Official Statement, 25 November 2009

"Neither Magnitsky, nor his lawyers ever requested from investigators that he'd be released from custody due to his health."

The Russian State Investigative Committee Found No Evidence of Wrong-Doing

The Russia State Investigative Committee announced that there was "no ground for launching a criminal investigation into Magnitsky's death in custody" two days after his death

Russian Investigative Committee, Moscow Branch



18 November 2009

The Russian Prosecutor's Office Found No Evidence of Wrong-Doing

The Moscow Prosecutor's Office also found "no wrong-doing by officials, no violations of the law and no evidence of Magnitsky's complaints" 7 days after Magnitsky's death

General Prosecutor's Office Announces Probe

	ЛЬНАЯ ПРОКУРАТУРА ЖОЙ ФЕДЕРАЦИИ Степлет 1
сакулльный	CMT
Руководство	Глания Слания — Канста — Канста тополоси объятся быланыя — В Раская прокрукция прокрукция прокрукция прокрукция И 1 Орган Манантокон
Структура	новости
Докуневты	18.11.3009
Новости	В Москве проводится прокурорская проверка по факту смерти в СИЗО № 1 Сергея Магнитского
Новисти Гонеральной прокуратуры Россан	Прекратура т. Молям провыдат травнум в следственное натактире № 1 «Метросская теались» собладение прав обваняению Сергея Напостают на содолное надано синстрито и натериолич-бытовоть обоспочения в териц содоржания год странкай.
Ковости прикрытур субъектия федероция	37-летий Сартяї Матитский сканалог в спедственни кваттуре 16 новіди 2009 г. Па предварательни данник, очерь наступних от сведачной надостаточности
і Ария новостий	Праниры находится на кантрым програди прода. Падиаданние: <u>Программи разда / "Наход.</u>

18 November 2009



 HUG2FADTBA 1. MOC2BA
 Capacitory response of activity of the second second

Мененский С.Л. посудава в ФУ ИО-755 УФСИ ГРЕСИИ № 1. Мосси 21/2308. 10/2308 поревсяни в ИВС М. 1 ГУВЦ т. Моссия, 0.02409. Токох обранов, в моля проверено резеловлять, что в Попрад собратание битителени к или странова, сотранизани мененинский служби УФСИИ чесли по г. Моссие сну осазавалась меленинския помощь в соответствия с вспанентных архитехных меленинския помощь в соответствия с вспанентных архитехных меленинския помощь в соответствия с

Рокот с участво спортанисто прозлатиятся прочалие прочеди облатизская каконская с ачинали Малитового. Сл. в перезола на перезола и представата котрой брага дана контекствована волика оторатизатисти с озданованы мадианской блакование боликаниеми оторатизатися с уздебо-малициостра иссладования бурат Малитекето С.И. тора на исстоятора представания бурат. Малитекето С.И. тора на исстание представания с дана и представания прочеда на торатора на исстанира представа да 31.10.000. Воколаком пределя контродуется по предста представания с на представания представания предста представания представания представания представания предста представания представания представания представания представания представания представания представания предста представания представания представания представания представания представания представания представания предста представания предс

нолами отдела во министранието законов министранието утоловитал навазаний Колонанении утоловитал навазаний Колонанении утоловитал навазаний

23 November 2009

<u>Conclusions</u> of the Probe into Magnitsky's Death in Custody by the Moscow Prosecutor's Office

> "<u>No violations in the actions of</u> <u>detention centre officials have been</u> <u>found as part of the probe.</u> Death occurred from acute heart failure. The probe has concluded that medical care was provided in detention... Magnitsky has never complained about his health or daily conditions in custody"

S.A. Gorunov - Head of Department on the Observance of the Law in the Penitentiary System, Moscow Prosecutor's Office

Matrosskaya Tishina Detention Centre Head Found No Evidence of Wrong-Doing

8 days after Magnitsky's death, the Head of Matrosskaya Tishina detention centre found no violations and ordered the case to be "Filed into the archive"

Internal Probe at Matrosskaya Tishina Detention Centre



Fikhret Tagiev Head of Matrosskaya Tishina



14 12 2005 ЗАКЛЮЧЕНИЕ о материалам про IN TTU VOCUL 17/2 УФСИН России по г. анальник оп ФБУ ИЗ-77/1 УФСИН России по г. Москве

24 November 2009

"<u>No violations found</u>. Cease any further probe. File the case into the archive"

Signed by: V.E. Bazaev Approved by: Fikhret Tagiev

Conclusions of the Probe on the Use of

Handcuffs Following Magnitsky's Death

Deputy Interior Minister Denies Magnitsky Was Sick

On 23 December 2009, one month after Magnitsky's death, Deputy Interior Minister Alexei Anichin also claimed that Magnitsky never complained about his health and detention conditions

Statement by Alexei Anichin, Deputy Interior Minister, 23 December 2009



Alexei Anichin, Deputy Interior Minister of Russia

опубликовано 23 дек '09 13:45

Дело Магнитского закрыто

текст: Владимипр Силаев/Infox.ru

Уголовное дело в отношении юриста Hermitage Capital Сергея Магнитского прекращено в связи с его смертью. Об этом заявил на пресс-конференции начальник СК МВД России Алексей Аничин, назвав юриста «виновным». По его словам, по факту смерти Магнитского ведомство представило 111 жалоб, среди которых нет ни одной об условиях содержания или состоянии здоровья. "Out of 111 complaints from pre-trial detention reviewed by the Interior Ministry, not a single complaint contained anything to do with his health or conditions of his detention"

Moscow Public Oversight Commission Finds Magnitsky Was Tortured to Death in Custody

On December 28, 2009, the Moscow Public Oversight Commission, an independent watchdog mandated by Russian law to monitor human rights in detention centres, launched its own independent investigation into Magnitsky's death in custody and found that Magnitsky was tortured to death



Valery Borshchev Head of the Moscow Public Oversight Commission

Report on Magnitsky's Death in Custody, 28 Dec 2009

An analysis of the sector of the sector

Main Conclusions of the Report

- **1. Magnitsky was systematically denied medical care in pre-trial detention**
- 2. Magnitsky was subjected to physical and psychological pressure
- 3. Magnitsky's right to life was violated by the State
- 4. Investigators, prosecutors and judges all played a role in his torturous conditions and treatment in custody
- 5. After his death, State officials lied and concealed the truth about his torture in custody and circumstances of his death

The Russian Government Completely Ignores The Findings of The Moscow Public Oversight Commission

The Moscow Public Oversight Commission sent their findings to five Russian Government bodies. All of them ignore the report and have not responded for two years since the report was issued

<u>Public Oversight Commission Sends the</u> <u>Report to Government Bodies</u>





Presidential Administration

General Prosecutor Office

Federal Penitentiary Service





Valery Borschev, Head of the Moscow Public Oversight Commission



Moscow Helsinki Group Files Application to Open a Criminal Case into Torture and Murder

On 27 March 2010, Ludmila Alexeeva, Head of the Moscow Helsinki Group, filed an application to open the criminal case against Interior Ministry officers for the torture and murder of Sergei Magnitsky

> Application to Open Case for Torture and Murder of Magnitsky (27 March 2010)



Ludmila Alexeeva, Head of the Moscow Helsinki Group



"This death [of Sergei Magnitsky], however, did not occur accidentally. It did not occur merely through the oversight or negligence of some particular detention center officials. Mr Sergei Magnitsky died from torture that was deliberately inflicted upon him by officers of the Interior Ministry (Silchenko O.F. and Kuznetsov A.K.), and also by subordinates of Kuznetsov A.K (Krechetov, Tolchinsky, Droganov and others."
Russian Investigative Committee Rejects The Moscow Helsinki Group Complaint

Russian Investigative Committee refused to open a case against Silchenko, Tolchinsky, Kuznetsov, Oleinik for the torture and murder of Magnitsky, who were named in the Moscow Helsinki Group complaint, because "no crime committed"

Denial to Open Case for the Torture and Murder of Magnitsky (21 June 2010)





Sergei Magnitsky's Mother Made Dozens of Different Requests For Information on The Death of Her Son



The Russian Investigative State Committee Denies Nearly All Requests for Information Filed by Magnitsky's Mother



Despite the Official Denials, Russian Society Demands Answers

More than 3,500 articles were written by the Russia media repeating the story of Magnitsky's false arrest, torture and death



Source: Russian press Fativa search on cumulative basis for the period

Interior Ministry Launches Media Campaign to Cover Up Their Crimes

Seven months after Magnitsky's death, the Interior Ministry General responsible for sanctioning Magnitsky's arrest, Oleg Logunov, claimed on radio that Magnitsky never complained about his health



Oleg Logunov, Deputy Head of Interior Ministry's Investigative Committee *

Interview with Business FM radio station, 7 June 2010

На сайте ведомства размещено интервью радиостанции "Бизнес ФМ" руководителя Правового управления генпрокуратуры Олета Логунова (он же бывший заместитель главы Следственного комитета при MBД), который говорит, что Магнитский за весь период следствия не предъявлял жалоб на состояние здоровья. По его данным, у Магнитского был холецистит, который не препятствует нахождению в местах заключения, а на сердце он никогда не жаловался.

Логинов сообщил, что Магнитский отказывался давать показания, хотя ему предлагали сотрудничать со следствием и более мягкую меру пресечения.

По словам Логинова, смерть Магнитского была внезапной и стала "большим ударом" для следствия. "Я считаю, что смерть Магнитского обусловлена недостаточной квалификацией, недостаточным уровнем медицинского обслуживания в наших СИЗО", - сказал прокурор. "For the whole period of his detention, the investigation did not receive a single complaint about his health"

* Promoted to Head of Legal Department of the Russian General Prosecutor Office in December 2009

Investigative Committee Joins The Public Cover-Up

One year after Magnitsky's death, Alexander Bastrykin, Head of Investigative Committee, gave an interview to the Rossiiskaya Gazeta Newspaper, claiming that no officials were guilty in Magnitsky's death and his death was an accident

Interview by Alexander Bastrykin with Rossiiskaya Gazeta, 7 September 2010



Alexander Bastrykin, Head of the Russian Investigative Committee



"<u>There is no ground to think that</u> <u>his death was connected to actions</u> <u>of officials who prosecuted him.</u> There is no objective information showing that he was prosecuted illegally or that physical and psychological pressure was applied to him"

Head of Moscow Court Joins The Public Cover-Up

Olga Egorova, Chairwoman of the Moscow City Court, claimed that the judges, who extended Magnitsky's detention, did not know about health problems and Magnitsky had not asked to be released on account of his health

Interview by Olga Egorova on Echo Moscow Radio station, 14 September 2010



Olga Egorova, Chairwoman of the Moscow City Court

АЛОНЗАНЯ РАДИО	ЭфИР ВИДЕО ГОРЯЧ С К В Ы ТРАКЛАЦИЯ ЗФИР ВЫПОС КИВОНСТИ		ПЕРЕДАЧИ ПЕРСІ ВИКТОР СУХОРУ "Дифирамб" Задать погрос
000	НОВОСТИ БЛОГИ ТОП	Ы ОПРОСЫ РЕЙТИІ	HFN DOC AAB (
	КВАРТИРЫ С ОТДЕЛІ ОТ 2,7 МЛН. РУБ ПРЕДЛОЖЕНИЕ ОГРАНИЧЕ	200	подписывайся на наш twitter: @EchoMskRu
NOHCK B HOBOCTAX			م
НОВОСТЬ СОДЕРЖА	ние Комментарии ()		† <u>Все новости</u>
	ІНОСИЛ РЕШЕНИЕ О ПРО Я МАГНИТСКОГО, МОГ ПР		

н контернот или указа или указа (даря, который выносил решение о продлении срока содержания под стражей юриста фонда Hermitage Сарата Серена Малинского, кол просто не знать о болезики, подснедствениято. Так сичтает предодатель Моготорида Dama Exposa. Секе иненене не высовалая в прочим эфере радисствии "Эко Москва". "Он не завалил лодетайство об освобождении в сакаи с его тякелови осотоянием здоровы".

Напоннии, Матинтский скончался в СИЗО осенью прошлого года. Его смерть вызвала широкий общественный резонанс. По факту его гибели было возбуждено уполовное дело по статьям «неоказание помощи больному» и «халатьсст»- "Magnitsky did not request to be released due to his health. The judges probably did not know about his health"

Head of Prison Service Joins The Public Cover-Up

Yuri Kalinin, former Head of the Federal Penitentiary Service*, gives an interview to Vzglad newspaper claiming that medical treatment was provided to Magnitsky while in custody, his death was an "accident", and he received adequate medical care

Interview of Yuri Kalinin to Vzglyad newspaper, 4 April 2011



Yuri Kalinin, former head of the Federal Penitentiary Service *

	Базафи	Дынграй Медисата	Владанир Путан	Acoo Map		Ворыны на врсеналах	Осставна Матвон	
жанана оснатия. Навый призирот Махми втрадочного с политично с Рассии	NUT howhere re	0.000	CROPT ROTATIONA	Hajamana		In gand Poondepr; In Croo	лекателен на востально начат	
erveuenen n Persei CEA: Caburan n Inmis peumor repônere cros presses in policien					E CE	Hances Research Pychol re restored (#research pass)	Annual statest Property	алық туден, катарыя Родина
Нургалива апрестился от заявляение о победя над корруганий	Norganoow nois	ха х Гараду ебилил Хунинх частарскай даги	«Баролона» выпраля у «Пар Тарины	ty- Compositor	100	Hou Wanape: Income galeryo emprove a Typine (22 annual)		il venenos, largo Piscale
Daviens. Bartens et al. Alterna et al. Alte	«Усна полог приог нам откли сонтраль и службы негоричести и присити	ком на дело М Манудравсов ФСШІ граж; си против. Нап вого рядом вет	с побегоно, – занякт и ниссти также гиролы Даглинциков то стал. развитива, В джу данаскому дараво по подрагдаленног г, а многие колон	инерные с в России. К та иден и в региона ютранено находить ин индино	epega mo. B mo. B mo. B	е вдет экспераме ы за? м числе и в глузя алообразующими	тор ФСИН Юри еформы перги	A KAMMUR, Tax of DITO REMOVERS.
вто окажет нацим сотр Минудраку? А потозе я пормальный уровень ок	RE CHIEFTARO	что явля цтря	воохранение нас	только ря	marto		10	Tanga Mar
Почему эта попциятива никто так и не доказат	араную пр карасс, кот	оговаю-следст горый спожно (пинијно связь ме Было предусмотр	KAY DESTE	theor my of		ALCON	Statiscus Statiscus

"The death of Magnitsky was an accident that was hard to foresee. He received medical care for his diagnosed illness"

* Currently a Russian Senator

The Russian Justice Minister Joins The Public Cover-Up

A year and a half after Magnitsky's death in custody, Justice Ministry Alexander Konovalov stated it is too early to say whether Magnitsky was a victim.

> <u>Minister Konovalov at the Meeting with EU Home Affairs</u> <u>Commissioner (20 May 2011)</u>



Alexander Konovalov, Justice Minister

General Prosecutor Office Exonerates Interior Ministry Officers

General Prosecutor Office made statement that no wrong-doing was found in actions of Interior Ministry officers on the case against Magnitsky

Official Statement of General Prosecution Office, 30 May 2011



General Prosecutor Yuriy Chaika

Russian Investigative Committee Website

О ходе расследования уголовного дела по факту смерти Сергея Магнитского

30 wax 2011 max, @ 13



ацине касалось проверы обстоятитьств осуществления уколовного преследования Сергея Маналосаго Следственным петим при ИЩ Рессийской Федерации, то есть дойствий следоватият МВД Олека Саличиная, о процеводстве которого рапось упловене доло. В частвости, Следственный камитет России просил Генералиији провратуру РФ дат и очене в соборащить замочести переда и окоазнаей проветнами. Манистато С. К. у изованой ответственности ания в отношния нато мера просенияти, проветнами Данием Саличина, расскитрения правили от настали в замостато переда косавана проветнами. Дания даниет са стравения под стравити след прави и замостато переда и основана проветнами.

Наданно Сладственным компетски был получен ответ от заместитети Генерального прокрора Российский Фадерации, согласно клаторому нарушений фадерального законодательства, ущимпаниция конституционные права участников узголеного судагороналадства, сладователем МВД Силиченик О.Ф. гран осуществления узголения преследования Манитского С.Л. не долущено.

Тите не меще, Слидственные компеттите Риссии теродитичеств расслядование уполекото дала с округи Саркия Малитски Срои спедствия, как рыние сообщилось, продлям до 24 ануста 3011 года. Это связае с тронедлинии дополнительное спрабления дирактов цанстратила, катора правления на содуше Специансти на разлежны областях издаданы. Кроян того следствия манярого установлеть не токные се обстативлиства смерти Манитского, но и обстативлись, связаемые с его завлениеми правледии, устоянии с соденныеми, продлеми се ода орести ла 1, а гласа для на проворо симие. "Following the probe by the General Prosecutor Office, <u>no wrong-doing or violations</u> <u>of the law were identified in</u> <u>the actions of the Interior</u> <u>Ministry officers</u>, including Investigator Silchenko, against Magnitsky"

Head of Foreign Affairs Committee of the Russian Parliament Exonerates The Interior Ministry Officers

Kostantin Kosachev, in his blog on radio "Echo Moscow", publically stated that Magnitsky never complained about his health and nonreceipt of medical treatment

Official Statement of the Head of the Foreign Affairs Committee of the Russian State Duma (18 May 2010)



Konstantin Kosachev Foreign Affairs Committee of the Russian State Duma

avānu x	3 QNAE	видео горячие	интервью се	ГКА ПЕРЕДАЧИ І
РАДИО	0 K I M	ТРИНСТИЦИЯ ЗОНИЯ ВЫПИСК НОВОСТЕЙ	TPANCARILARI 3 CHAP Apxing Cetebroop	
000	новости	і блоги топы	опросы ре	ЙТИНГИ DOC АА
КВАРТИРЫ С ОТДЕЛКОЙ ОТ 2,5 МЛН РУБ. Э рядом сметро	P	"ХОЗЯЕВИ ЯКЕМЕНКІ УЖЕ САМІ НЕ РАДЫ.		тира 33м²
	w. •] [***	danie angest		م
Add con	w v] [m	Autre sargies	e boos	Anneway Boe.Gor
		dariw angoni		

"Magnitsky in many of his petitions ... to the investigators complained about everything, but never about his illness and non-receipt of medical care"

Interior Ministry Officers Who Magnitsky Testified Against Become Enormously Rich

In June 2010, evidence surfaced that the family of the Interior Ministry officer Kuznetsov became <u>US\$ 3 million richer</u> after the theft of \$230 million of taxes that Sergei Magnitsky had exposed



Born 28 February 1975

Assets purchased by family since the \$230 million theft: >\$ 3,000,000

Official Annual Salary: \$10,200

Kuznetsov's Family Assets

\$1.6 Million Apartment Registered to Kuznetsov's pensioner mother



0400: KUCORINGA ARADER PROFESSION Reconstrate and recover: 45-00 E 607015	A.F. 10.11.194
выхон: 02.11.1959 ОБД "ВОСТОЧНОЕ ИЗВІЙЛОВО" ГОРОДА ВОСКИН	
— Пачая —	
рес регистрация на отврштие: горід посіка, шклациайская ті., док 121, за	44
ернод действия права : с 11.01.2007	
ернод денсових права : с 11.01.2007	
CONCTRENCOCIL	
Persorpaneormai money mones 77-77-23/005/2007-1	
7сновный ножер : 77-77-23/003/2007-1	
давыдновская УК., дож 3 кв. 120	
нол-по понныт: 1 общ.площадь: 154.5 жилля площадь: 148.1	
общия площедь без учета балконов к лождий: 154.5 собствежных фонде: ДЕПАРТАВЕТ ИНПАДЕОВ ВОЛУПИИ: И ИНПАДЕОРО 40	REA FOROGA BOCKER
Бытанын семпетельства с собятенности	
- opinionini cangelenioran ago - in correct	

\$990,000 Apartment Registered to Kuznetsov's pensioner father



\$81,000 Mercedes-Benz and \$131,000 Range Rover, both <u>registered to</u> <u>Kuznetsov's wife</u>



Source: http://russian-untouchables.com/eng/artem-kuznetsov/; http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4ZB3YoAvEro

\$65,000 Land Rover <u>registered in</u> the name of Kuznetsov's mother



Interior Ministry Officers Who Magnitsky Testified Against Become Enormously Rich

In July 2010, evidence surfaced that the family of the Interior Ministry officer Karpov became US\$ 1.3 million richer after the theft of \$230 million of taxes that Sergei Magnitsky had exposed



Born 27 August 1977

Assets purchased by family	
since the \$230 million theft:	>\$1,300,000
Official Annual Salary:	\$ 6,000

Karpov's Family Assets

\$930,000 Apartment Registered to Karpov's pensioner mother



\$120,000 Land plots <u>Registered to Karpov's pensioner mother</u>



\$72,000 Mercedes-Benz E280 registered to Karpov



овд района знізино гор. моска

\$41,000 Porsche and \$47,000 Audi A3 registered to Karpov's mother

AK - N 749554 ov 27.11.2000



Source: <u>http://russian-untouchables.com/eng/pavel-karpov/</u>; <u>http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1TWhlPqVddc</u>

Tax Officials Who Magnitsky Testified Against Become Enormously Rich

In April 2011, evidence surfaced that the family of the Head of Tax office No 28 - <u>Olga Stepanova</u>, became US\$ 39 million richer after she approved the illegal tax rebate of \$230 million that Sergei Magnitsky had exposed



Born 29 July 1962

Stepanova's Family Assets

\$28 million Moscow Estate Registered to Stepanova's pensioner mother in law



\$3 million Palm Jumeirah, Dubai Sea Front Villa Registered to Stepanova's husband



\$11 million in Cash held on the Offshore Companies Swiss Accounts Registered to





Assets purchased by family
since the \$230 million theft:>\$38,912,000Official Annual Salary:\$38,381

Source: http://russian-untouchables.com/eng/olga-stepanova/; http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=H7yBOEPYJTc

Magnitsky's Boss Files Criminal Complaints Against The Corrupt Officials: Kuznetsov, Karpov & Stepanova

Sergei Magnitsky's boss, filed complaints submitting the evidence of sudden enormous wealth of the families of the Interior Ministry officers Kuznetsov and Karpov and Tax official Stepanova

Complaint About the Wealth of Officer Kuznetsov's Family



Jamison Firestone, Sergei Magnitsky's boss, Managing **Partner of Firestone Duncan**

(21 May 2010)



"According to available data, officer Kuznetsov has committed abuse of office and enriched himself and his family after the theft of \$230 million from the State budget. His wealth is far above from his official income"

Complaint About the Wealth of Officer Karpov's Family (13 July 2010)



"According to available data, officer Karpov has committed abuse of office and enriched himself and his family after the theft of \$230 million from the State budget. His wealth is far above from his official income" Investigative Committee

President's Administration

General **Prosecutor Office**

Interior Ministry's Internal Security Division





"According to available data, Tax official Stepanova has committed abuse of office and enriched herself and her family after the theft of \$230 million from the State budget. Her wealth is far above from her official income"

Interior Ministry Refuses To Investigate The Officers

Deputy Interior Minister Alexei Anichin said it was not Interior Ministry's job to investigate its own officers implicated by Magnitsky



Alexei Anichin Deputy Interior Minister

Interview on 'Echo Moscow' radio station, 3 July 2010



А.ИНИЧИН: Му, это слишком долго перечискить. Кого эта тема интересует, пусть откроит 151-ю статью Уголов -процессульного каденса, и там весь перечинь статей, что относится к нашей подследственности, что к подследственности следователий порохратуры. Q: "After Magnitsky's death we learned from his diaries about the Interior Ministry officers who he had been named and who had orchestrated the case against him. Have you investigated them or carried out any probe at all?

A: "<u>This is not part of our</u> <u>remit</u>"

Head of Interior Ministry Joins The Public Cover-Up

Russian Interior Minister Rashid Nurgaliev said in his interview with the RBC newspaper that he did not know anything about any wrongdoing of his officers

Interview by Rashid Nurgaliev with RBC Daily, 12 August 2010



Rashid Nurgaliev Interior Minister



"<u>I have not seen</u> <u>anything.</u> Everybody is just trying to pull at threads"

Interior Ministry Exonerates The Interior Ministry Officers and The Tax Officials

On 15 November 2010, the Interior Ministry spokeswoman Irina Dudukina said the enormous wealth of the Interior Ministry officers was legitimate and the Tax officials, who illegally rebated \$ 230 million from the Russian Treasury in one day were "tricked", and a rebate of that magnitude and haste is the "normal practice"

Interior Ministry Official Statement - Interfax Press conference (15 Nov 2010)



Irina Dudukina, Spokeswomen, Interior Ministry Investigative Department

In relation to the Interior Ministry Officers:

"<u>We made all the required checks ... All [the wealth] is</u> legitimate and declared ..."

In relation to the Tax officials:

"The Tax officials <u>were tricked</u> ... <u>and in relation to the</u> <u>haste of the payments then it is a normal practice</u> ... anyone could request the rebate in December and in December the overpaid taxes will be returned"

Instead of Being Prosecuted, The Officers Implicated in Magnitsky Case Are Promoted

Officers Silchenko, Karpov and Kuznetsov were all <u>promoted</u> to higher police ranks

Oleg Silchenko



Pavel Karpov

Artem Kuznetsov

Officers Involved in Magnitsky's Torture Are Also Given State Honours

On the one-year anniversary of Magnitsky's death, five officers who played a key role in the false arrest, torture and murder of Magnitsky were also given <u>top state honours by the Interior Ministry</u>



President's Human Rights Council Assembles Experts

President Medvedev's Human Rights Council, consisting of 40 permanent members, formed its Working Group on the Magnitsky Case and invited additional experts to conduct an independent investigation into Magnitsky case



President's Human Rights Council



Mikahil Fedotov - Chairman of President's Human Rights Council

Council Working Group



Ludmila Alexeeva -Tamara Morshakova – Kirill Kabanov -**Ex** -Constitutional Chairman of Anti-Chairwomen Moscow Helsinki Corruption Committee Court Judge – Adviser



Elena Panfilova-Director





Chairwomen





Mara Polyakova-Svetlana Sorokinawell known TV journalist

Irina Yasina – Chairwomen **Regional journalist** association





Source: http://www.president-sovet.ru/structure/group 8/materials/index.php?sphrase id=2257

President's Human Rights Council Publishes Its Findings

On 5 July 2011, Human Rights Council published its report identifying that Magnitsky's arrest and detention was unlawful, he was beaten before his death, and his prosecution by officers earlier implicated by him in corruption, was illegal



Mikahil Fedotov Chairman of President's Human Rights Council











Alexeeva

Panfilova Kabanov

ov Polyakova

va Borschev

Conclusions:

- 1. Magnitsky's arrest and detention were in breach of the European Human Rights Convention;
- 2. Magnitsky was beaten, which led to his death;
- 3. In contravention of the law Magnitsky was prosecuted by same officers he earlier implicated in corruption;
- 4. State bodies resist full investigation into corruption and fraud uncovered by Magnitsky;
- 5. The Russian courts failed to provide any legal redress to Sergei Magnitsky

Members of the President's Human Rights Council

Source: http://www.president-sovet.ru/structure/group_8/materials/index.php?sphrase_id=2257; http://tussian-untouchables.com/rus/does/D290.pdf-

President Medvedev Acknowledges Crimes Had Been Committed

Following the presentation of the Human Rights Council's findings on Magnitsky case, President Medvedev acknowledged that crimes had been committed

President Medvedev's Meeting with Human Rights Council (5 July 2011)



President Medvedev

Тема Магнитского. Знаете, я скажу совсем коротко. Я все поручения дал и спедственным структурам, и Генеральной прокуратуре, с тем чтобы собрали все, что есть на эту тему и еще раз прошлись по всему этому материалу. И только что расписал вашу бумагу соответствующим структурам.

Меня волнует только одно. Случай Магнитского - это, конечно, очень печальный случай. Потому что человека не стало и, судя по всему, там действительно были какие-то преступления, которые как минимум привели к этому результату. Люди не должны в порыме эмирать, если они болект, они должны оттуда выходить лечиться, а потом их судьбу должен определять суд. Но мме просто очень не хотепось бы, чтобы мы проблему большого количества пюдей, которые, наверное, сидят в торымах, не всегда обоснованой и справодиво, союдити к проблеме одного дела.

Потому что у меня порой возникает ощущение, что в нашей стране есть топько две проблемы, которые должны волновать тех, кто занимается правами чеповека, прокуроров, в конечном счете Президента, - это дело Малиитского и дело Ходорковского. Большие серьезные дела, но я считаю, что все-таки мы должны смотреть глубже. "Magnitsky's case is, of course, a very sad case. The man is gone, and to all appearance, <u>indeed</u> <u>some crimes were</u> <u>committed</u> leading at least to this result"

Interior Ministry Immediately Dismisses The President's Human Rights Council's Findings

Interior Ministry immediately dismissed findings of the President's Human Rights Council claiming no violations committed by its officers in the Magnitsky case

Official statement made by Tatiana Gerasimova (6 July 2011)



Tatiana Gerasimova, General Major, First Deputy Head, Interior Ministry Investigative Department



Пресс-служба Следственного департамента МВД уже отреагировала на заключение Совета по развитию гражданского общества и правам человека, «Следователями Следственного хомитета при МВД (позднее он был переименован в Следственный департамент) принимались законные и обоснованные решения при расследовании этого дела», – сообщила пресс-служба. Первый заместитель главы ведомства Татьяна Герасниова добавила, что все решения были подтверждены <u>прокуратиров</u> и судом. "<u>There was no wrong-</u> <u>doing</u>. All decisions were checked by prosecutors and courts finding them to be in order"

Interior Ministry Say The President's Human Rights Council's Findings Are Not Relevant

Interior Ministry went on to say that the Presidential Human Rights Council report contained "No relevant information whatsoever"

Decree by Interior Ministry Investigator Kibis (14 July 2011)



The Official Position of The Russian Government

Seven Days After Magnitsky's Death President Medvedev Orders an Investigation

After an appeal by the President's Human Rights Council, seven days after the Magnitsky's death, President Medvedev ordered the General Prosecutor Office and the Ministry of Justice to conduct a probe into Magnitsky's death and report findings



Medvedev Then Announces Firing of 20 Prison Officials "as a result" of Magnitsky's Death

On December 4th, 2009, President Medvedev then announced the firing of 20 officials of the Federal Penitentiary Service ("FSIN")



Contrary To The President's Public Statement, The Firings Had Been Agreed Weeks Before Magnitsky's Death

In fact, according to official penitentiary public statement, a broad reshuffling of penitentiary officials had been approved in October 2009, leading to the promotion, transfer and reappointment of most officials and none of the firing had anything to do with the Magnitsky's case

After Magnitsky;s Death Medvedev Fired 20 Prison Officials Who Were then Reappointed

После смерти Магнитского Медведев уволил 20 руководителей ФСИН

время публикации: 11 декабря 2009 г., 12:48 последнее обновление: 11 декабря 2009 г., 17:31 44200

Президент РФ Дмитрий Медведев освободил от должности несколько сотрудников органов Федеральной службы исполнения наказаний (ОСИН). Указ президента от 4 декабря был опубликован только в пятницу. Как стало известно, увольнения в основном связаны с масштабной реорганизацией ведомства.

В то же время, как сообщил глава ФСИН Александр Реймер, по крайней мере несколько отставок и дисциплинарных высканий произошли после проведенной служебной <u>проверки</u> по факту <u>смерти</u> юриста инвестиционного фонда Hermitage Capital Management Cepreя Магнитского. В



Как пояснил представитель ФСИН Александр Кромин, речь во многих случаях идет о перестановках в рамках кадрового реформирования и структурных преобразований в центральном аппарате ФСИН и в регионах. Часть из отстраненных от должности чиновников будет переназначена, другая часть будет повышена в своих должностях.

11 December 2009

Official Statement on 20 Officials Firing made by representative of the Federal Penitentiary Service Alexander Kromin

"Their firing is mainly due to the large restructuring of the agency. <u>The firing is not</u> <u>connected to Magnitsky's case</u>"

"Kromin of FSIN explained that many cases involve reappointments are being part of job rotation and structural reshuffling in the central department of the Federal Penitentiary Service and in the regions. One part of the fired officials will be reappointed, the other part will be promoted"

Only One of The Fired Officials Was Involved in The Magnitsky Case

Also, only one official had been connected to Magnitsky's torture and death in custody. The others worked in different regions and in different departments

	List of 20 Fired Prison Officials	Known Connection to Magnitsky Case	
/	1) Mr Amaev, head of FSIN in Baikal region	NO NO	
	2) Mr Brant, head of FSIN in Tula		
	3) Mr Zarubin, head of FSIN in Tyumen	NO Only 1 out of 20 officia	al
<	4) Mr Davydov, head of FSIN in Moscow	YES had connection to	
	5) Mr Izmalkov, head of FSIn in Yakutia	NO	
	6) Mr Khamadishin, head of FSIN in Tatarstan	wiagnitsky case	
	7) Mr Malenchuk, head of FSIN in St Petersburg	NO	
	8) Mr Petrenko, head of FSIN in Vologda	NO	
	9) Mr Posmakov, head of FSIN in Moscow oblast	NO	
	10) Mr Potapenko, head of FSIN in Voronezh oblast	NO	
	11) Mr Uryavin, head of FSIN in Komi		
	12) Mr Bachurin, head of FSIN operational and technical	NO	
	events	NO	
	13) Mr Borodulin, head of FSIN engineering, technical	NO	
	support, and ammunition	NO	
	14) Mr Gontsov, head of FSIN human resources		
	15) Mr Novikov, head of FSIN guards	NO	
	16) Mr Ruchkin, head of FSIN bailiffs	NO	
	17) Mr Telukha, head of FSIN remand centers and prisons	s NO	
	18) Mr Troitsky, head of FSIN medical department		
	19) Mr Shirshov, head of FSIN personnel and training	NO	
\backslash	20) Mr Repiev, head of FSIN transportation	NO	
$\overline{\ }$	20) III Replet, near of FSIIt transportation	NO	

Investigative Committee Extends The Investigation into Sergei Magnitsky's Death Nine Times

During two years since Magnitsky's death, the Russian Investigative State Committee has extended the term of its investigation nine times without making any conclusions

The Investigation into Sergei Magnitsky death



Investigative Committee Charges Two Doctors of Butyrka Detention Centre

On 20 September 2011, the Russian Investigative State Committee announced that two doctors from Butyrka prison: Larisa Litvinova and Dmitry Kratov were accused of "negligence" in the Magnitsky's case



However, The Government Changes The Cause of Death Before Issuing Charges

Strangely, the two doctors have been accused of failing to diagnose Diabetes and Hepatitis – two illnesses, which Sergei Magnitsky had never had

<u>Medical Records</u> from Matrosskaya Tishina Detention Centre <u>13 July 2009</u>



"<u>Based on the results of the ultrasound</u> examination, gallstones are diagnosed. Diagnosis:

<u>Gallstones, chronic cholecystitis</u> <u>and pancreatis</u>"

 Image: State of the state

Medical Expertise No 555/10 made by

Ministry of Health 15 June 2011

58 Out of 60 Russian Officials Remain Unpunished

After two years only two out of 60 Russian officials implicated in the Magnitsky's case have been indicted for a crime. The rest have been exonerated

The Cardin List of the Russian Officials Implicated in The Magnitsky's Case

#	Name	Public Institution	# Name	Public Institution		
1	A.V. Anichin	Russian Interior Ministry	29 S. N. Lazutkin	Investigative Comm.Prosecutor office		
2	O.V. Logunov	Russian Interior Ministry	30 A.V. Mazhaev	Investigative Comm.Prosecutor office		
3	A.N. Matveev	Russian Interior Ministry	31 Aleksandr Burov	Prosecutor office		
4	Oleg Silchenko	Russian Interior Ministry	32 Andrey Pechegin	Prosecutor office		
5	G.V. Karlov	Russian Interior Ministry	33 Viktor Grin	Prosecutor office		
6	Natalya Vinogradova	Russian Interior Ministry	34 Sergei Zhemchuzhnikov	Russian Tax Authorities		
7	A.I. Ryabinin	Russian Interior Ministry	35 Raisa Burmistrova	Russian Tax Authorities		
8	S.V. Oleinik	Russian Interior Ministry	36 Aleksandra Kuznetsova 37 Yulia Koltunova	Russian Tax Authorities		
9	M.O. Sapunova	Russian Interior Ministry		Russian Tax Authorities Russian Tax Authorities		
	E.V. Mikhailov	Russian Interior Ministry	38 Olga Stepanova 39 Olga Tsymay	Russian Tax Authorities		
11	Gritsai	Russian Interior Ministry	40 Svetlana Dubrovskava	Russian Tax Authorities		
12	Varganov	Russian Interior Ministry	40 Svetrana Dubi Ovskaya 41 Olga Davydova	Russian Tax Authorities		
	N. I. Dmitieva	Russian Interior Ministry	42 Yekaterina Frolova	Russian Tax Authorities		
14	A.A. Malygina	Russian Interior Ministry	43 Olesya Shargorodskaya	Russian Tax Authorities		Exonerated
15	Artem Kuznetsov	Russian Interior Ministry	44 Maksim Tretyakov	Russian Tax Authorities		Ελυπει άιευ
16	Aleksey Droganov	Russian Interior Ministry	45 Yelena Khimina	Civil Courts		
17	Dmitri Tolchinskiy	Russian Interior Ministry	46 Sergei Podoprigorov	Civil Courts		
18	Andrei Krechetov	Russian Interior Ministry	47 Aleksey Krivoruchko	Civil Courts		
19	Aleksandr Klevtsov	Russian Interior Ministry	48 Svetlana Ukhnalyova	Civil Courts		
20	Anatoly Mikhalkin	Russian Interior Ministry	49 Yelena Stashina	Civil Courts		
	Pavel Karpov	Russian Interior Ministry	50 Galina Filippova	Civil Courts		
	I.A. Glukhov	Russian Interior Ministry	51 Tatyana Korneyeva	Civil Courts		
	Nikolai Budilo	Russian Interior Ministry	52 Rufina Gazizova	Civil Courts		
	Oleg Urzhumtsev	Russian Interior Ministry	53 Andrey Yushkov 54 Yelena Kim	Civil Courts Civil Courts		
	Aleksandr Kuvaldin	Federal Security Service	55 Ildar Salimzyanov	Civil Courts		
26	Viktor Voronin	Federal Security Service	56 Margarita Zinurova	Civil Courts		
	Stanislav Gordievsky	Investigative Comm.Prosecutor office	57 Ivan Prokopenko	Prison Officials		
	N.A. Yakimovich	Investigative Comm.Prosecutor office		Prison Officials		
			59 Dmitriy Kratov	Prison Officials	-	
		•	60 Larisa Litvinova	Prison Officials		• Under investigation

Prosecutor's Office Resumes the Fabricated Case Against Magnitsky 20 Months After His Death

In August 2011, the Prosecutor's Office re-opened the criminal case against Sergei Magnitsky, 20 months after his death

Order to Re-open the Case Against Magnitsky (2 August 2011)





орто инии.дипросдения августа. /ИТАР-ТАСС/. Генеральная прокуратура России отменила постановление о прек

апты Мага

МОККОА, Z августа. ИПАР-ТАСС. Текеральная прокуратура госсии отнениля постановение о прекращении уголовного дела в отношении консультанта британского фонда "Эринтаж Кыпитал менеджмент" Сергея Магнитского, скончавшегося в 2009 году в больнице СИЗО "Матросская тишина".

Как сообщила ИТАР-ТАСС официальный представитель Генпрокуратуры Марина Гриднева, "такое решение принято в совзи с принятиен Констлуционнын судон РФ постановления от 14 июля, обязывающего следственные органы выяснять отношение родственников к прекращению в отношении унершего уголовного преследование во нерезбылитирующин основанией".

По ее словая, возобновив расследование, Генпрохуратура поставила перед Следственным деваталенетом МВД /объщими Следственным компитетон при MBД, расследоващим дело в отношении Матинтского об уклонении от уплаты налогов, "вопрос о возобновлении расследования, по результата которого следствие, с учетон инения близком родствеников Сергем Алинитского, должом принять законове решение". "Deputy General Prosecutor has ordered to reopen the case against Sergei Magnitsky"

Marina Gridneva, General Major, Spokesperson, General Prosecutor Office

Interior Ministry Announces Magnitsky's Guilt is "Fully Proven"

The Russian Interior Ministry also announced that "his guilt has been fully proven"

Interior Ministry Statement "Magnitsky Guilt has been Proven" (4 August 2011)



Spokesperson Investigative Committee Interior Ministry

СК при МВД: Вина Магнитского доказана

Вина юриста фонда Hermitage Capital Managment Сергея Магнитского, умершего в больнице след «Матросская тишина», доказана следствием, сообщили в пресс-службе следственного департамен 🖌

C Recommend Sign Up to see what your friends recommend.

«В ходе расследования вина Сергея Магнитского в совершении им преступления полностью доказана собранными по уголовному делу доказательствами, что позволило предварительному следствию предъявить ему обвинение в совершении им двух эпизодов преступлений по статье УК РФ «Уклонение от уплаты налогов». Аналогичное обвинение по делу предъявлено подданному Великобритании Уильяму Феликсу Браудеру», – сказал представитель МВД, передает <u>ИТАР-ТАСС</u>.

Как сообщала газета ВЗГЛЯД, в среду следственный департамент МВД России возобновил расследование дела в отношении Магнитского.

Во вторник Генеральная прокуратура России <u>отменила постановление</u> о прекращении уголовного дела о совершении юристом Сергеем Магнитским налоговых преступлений.

"The guilt of Magnitsky has been proven by the investigation on the basis of collected evidences allowing to issue charges"

Interior Ministry Calls Sergei Magnitsky's Mother for Interrogation

After resuming the repressive, posthumous case against Sergei Magnitsky, the Interior Ministry summons his mother for questioning as a witness in the case against her dead son

Summons Issued to Magnitsky's Mother



Natalia Magnitskaya

года к 10 час. 00 мни ишеновыше органа презная россия по адресу: к спедователю следе (длях подполкомнику юсть в качестве свядетеля. Одновременно сос пригласить защитлика участия защитника сле	№ от и со ст. 1 нн. в след арительного г. Моск ственной кность, сазе иноти С общаю, ка само	171сч. СМРН Почестка о вылове ва допрое 188 УПК РФ Вам надлежит прибить «29» авкуста 2011 почества допоро 188 УПК РФ Вам надлежит прибить «29» авкуста 2011 почестви доподати прибить мариализация 188 УПК РФ Вам надлежит прибить «29» авкуста 2011 почестви доподати прибить мариализация 188 УПК РФ Вам надлежит прибить «29» авкуста 2011 почестви доподати прибить мариализация почестви доподати прибить прибить прибить прибить в спедствиим Вим приви
В соответствии года к 10 час. об мы полнование орган среда Колдоновление с соответство подполновитело с съеб подполновитело с с съеб подполновитело с съеб подполновитело с с с с с с с с с с с с с с с с с с с	от и со ст. 1 им. в <u>след</u> арительной <u>г. Моск</u> <u>глиенной</u> инии <u>С</u> общаю, ка само	Полестка о вклюке на допрос 10 вклюке на допрос 18 уПК РФ Вым надалежит прибить «29» авкуста 2011 истисника управление Следотенного департамента ММЈ годати и при продукти и при при при при при при при при при
В соответствии года к 10 час. 60 мм россии по дрест россии по дрест соответся силиство свое соответся силиство в качестве силистеля. Одновременно соо портлакти защитник защитник частия защитник реаль.	и со ет. 1 ни. в <u>след</u> г. Моск ственной ищии С. общаю, ка само	о выголе на лопрос 188 УПГ ФО Вам надчелят прибить «29» актуста 2011 полнота издание Следственного лепартамента МВ/ следотиче лизание Полотския, и 10/2, забинет м.С. 7 группы Спецственного департамента МВ/1. России, состано и пол нама соотока, начитала анутновой М.О. (тех. св. (495) 667.31-15) для, допрос что для участия в следственном действии Вы вправе
года к 10 час. 00 мни инистояние органи презнани россии. по адресу: к следователно следе (длях подполновнику места в качестве свидетеля. Одновременно сос пригласить защитныка сле пригласить защитныка сле При задичени причин, г.	нь в <u>след</u> арительного <u>г. Моск</u> ственной кность, клас иции С общаю, ка само	о выголе на лопрос 188 УПГ ФО Вам надчелят прибить «29» актуста 2011 полнота издание Следственного лепартамента МВ/ следотиче лизание Полотския, и 10/2, забинет м.С. 7 группы Спецственного департамента МВ/1. России, состано и пол нама соотока, начитала анутновой М.О. (тех. св. (495) 667.31-15) для, допрос что для участия в следственном действии Вы вправе
года к 10 час. 00 мни ишеновыше органа презная россия по адресу: к спедователю следе (длях подполкомнику юсть в качестве свядетеля. Одновременно сос пригласить защитлика участия защитника сле	нь в <u>след</u> арительного <u>г. Моск</u> ственной кность, клас иции С общаю, ка само	188 УПК РФ Вам надлежит прибить «29» автуста 2011 истенное управление Следотенного департамента. М.И. состанка, вознаная Никотская, д. 102, абликет № 7. группы. Следственное дипирамента М.И. России источной М.О. (ист. са. (495) 464 (54):161). для допросо чито для участия в следственном действии Вы вправе
года к 10 час. 00 мни ишеновыше органа презная россия по адресу: к спедователю следе (длях подполкомнику юсть в качестве свядетеля. Одновременно сос пригласить защитлика участия защитника сле	нь в <u>след</u> арительного <u>г. Моск</u> ственной кность, клас иции С общаю, ка само	астренное зправление Слажатевного лепартамента МВJ состяти, доянны система, д. 10-2, кабинет № 7. приник Съектението департамента МВД. России, сслай чи па чине, фотом, начализат интичнова М.О. (т.е., с. 4, 495 164731-15) дик допреса что для участия в следственном действии Вы вправе
Вам или представлян	препятет ходатай ющим в	стоятельно, либо ходагайствовать об обеспечении ем в порядке, предусмотренном ст. 50 УПК РФ. музоциях явсе по вызову в назначенный срок, а также termo об обеспечении участия защитных следователем, в установленном порядке Ваши интересы лицам по тел. <u>667-31-15</u> или иных способом и представить
письменное заявление о В случае неявк основании ст. 113 У основании ст. 118 УПІ Заместитель начальни цоленость пилоговане от	об этом ки в у УПК РФ КРФ на ика 3 от гана, класси	по узлачнитому Выше адрусу, коланный срок без узважительных причин на в Ва можетс быть подакриткум привыху, либо на Ва может быть выдожная подаконе въмскание. Плен марактериальных подаконе выможание и на маракие фолькования со динатомати и под- конско департамента МВД России подполозиятелестиван конско департамента МВД России подполозиятелестиван

"You are requested for questioning on 29 August 2011 as a witness to appear at the office 75. Interrogation will be conducted by Investigator Sapunova. In case of not appearance without a plausible explanation you will be brought by force in accordance with Article 113 of the CPC or penalised in accordance with Article 118 of CPC"

Issued by Colonel Shamin, Interior Ministry's Investigative Committee (18 August 2011)

Следственный департамент МВД России Тактал пр. 6. Моска, 12509 У. 08.2011 № 17/сть СОРИ

The Same Team of Officers, Who Killed Sergei Magnitsky, Is Now Persecuting His Mother

The same investigators, who were responsible for Sergei Magnitsky's death, have summoned his mother as a witness in the posthumous case against her son



Investigator Silchenko





2 years after the Sergei Magnitsky's death



Investigator Silchenko





Natalia Magnitskaya

Source: As the letter issued by Lt. Colonel of Interior Ministry Lapshov as of 7 October 2011

The Russian Government Investigation Is Avoiding The Most Difficult Subjects

The Russian government knows exactly who tortured and killed Sergei Magnitsky, as well as who stole \$230 mln, but has refused to investigate and prosecute them

